

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK

```
-----X
ASHOT EGIAZARYAN,      )
                        )
      Plaintiff,        )  Civ. Action No.
                        )
      -against-         )  11 CIV 2670
                        )  (PKC) (GWG)
PETER ZALMAYEV,        )
                        )
      Defendant.        )
-----X
```

Tuesday, March 20, 2012

- - -

Videotape Deposition of RINAT R.

AKHMETSHIN held in the offices of Greenberg  
Traurig, 2101 L Street, Northwest, Washington,  
D.C. 20037 commencing at approximately 10:11 a.m.,  
on the above date, before Cindy L. Sebo,  
Registered Merit Reporter, Certified Real-Time  
Reporter, Certified Shorthand Reporter, Registered  
Professional Reporter, Certified Court Reporter,  
Real-Time Systems Administrator and Notary Public.

HUDSON REPORTING & VIDEO

1-800-310-1769

1 RINAT R. AKHMETSHIN

2 and -- strike that.

3 Are you aware that there were no  
4 e-mails that were provided in response to  
5 Exhibit 159?

6 A. I am aware of that.

7 Q. Why is it that that -- that you  
8 did not provide any e-mails in response to  
9 the subpoena that's been marked as  
10 Exhibit 159?

11 A. I routinely delete --

12 THE COURT REPORTER: I'm sorry?

13 THE WITNESS: I routinely  
14 delete my correspondence on matters  
15 and, in general, keep my mailbox  
16 light.

17 BY MR. COHEN:

18 Q. How do you decide what gets  
19 relief -- deleted or not deleted?

20 A. Something which is relevant, I  
21 keep, but what's irrelevant, things get  
22 deleted.

23 Q. If you were continuing to work  
24 on a particular project, do you retain the  
25 e-mails relating to that project until the

1 RINAT R. AKHMETSHIN

2 project is completed?

3 A. I don't.

4 Q. Have you checked whether deleted  
5 items that were on your computer could be  
6 retrieved from your computer?

7 A. I did check.

8 Q. How did you check?

9 A. I went to these undelete. I went  
10 to this trash box. I went to all those  
11 areas.

12 Q. Did you have any computer or  
13 information technology specialist look at  
14 your computer to determine whether documents  
15 that you believe were deleted could be  
16 located on the computer somewhere?

17 MR. SPERDUTO: Objection to the  
18 form.

19 THE WITNESS: I'm pretty  
20 comfortable with computers myself.

21 BY MR. COHEN:

22 Q. Did you go to anybody else to  
23 help -- to help you?

24 A. I don't ever go to anyone else.

25 Q. And did you in this case --

1 RINAT R. AKHMETSHIN

2 occasion go to anybody else?

3 A. I did not.

4 Q. Do you still have the computer?

5 A. Not that one. I have a new one  
6 now.

7 Q. When did you get a new computer?

8 A. I think it was last year, I  
9 think, sometime.

10 Q. At the end of 2011?

11 A. Correct.

12 Q. Were you notified by anyone that  
13 you should retain the computer during the  
14 pendency of the lawsuit by Ashot Egiazaryan  
15 against Peter Zalmayev?

16 A. I do not recall such warning.

17 Q. What was your process by which  
18 you maintained and deleted e-mails?

19 A. Could you please --

20 MR. SPERDUTO: I think you  
21 asked that, didn't you, Jason?

22 Asked and answered.

23 Go ahead if you --

24 THE WITNESS: Could you  
25 elaborate a little bit?

1 RINAT R. AKHMETSHIN

2 A. I --

3 Q. -- now?

4 A. -- just disposed of it.

5 Q. How did you dispose of it?

6 A. Just throw it out in the trash.

7 It wouldn't even start.

8 Q. Do you back up your computer?

9 A. Not regularly. I should,  
10 probably.

11 Q. Do you have a backup device that  
12 you use to -- to make sure if the computer  
13 crashes, you don't lose all your data --

14 A. No --

15 Q. -- and information?

16 A. -- no, I never have anything  
17 relevant.

18 It happens to me all the time.  
19 Sometimes I lose computer. I have a little  
20 child sometimes just step on it, and it  
21 just -- I go through many computers.

22 Q. And do you, from time to time,  
23 keep e-mails?

24 A. There's no system for this.

25 Q. Do you, from time to time, keep

1 RINAT R. AKHMETSHIN

2 BY MR. COHEN:

3 Q. Sure.

4 Did you have a regular practice  
5 of reviewing your computer on a regular basis  
6 to delete e-mails, or did you do it on a  
7 ongoing basis?

8 A. On an ongoing basis. There's no  
9 system; but, you know, I tend not to keep  
10 documents. Most of the documents have  
11 attachments which I save, but -- if it's  
12 relevant. If not, then -- because, you know,  
13 I tend not to keep a lot of mail.

14 Q. And where do you save  
15 attachments?

16 A. On the hard drive.

17 Q. What did you do with the  
18 computer that you used in 2010 and 2011 and  
19 you say you got rid --

20 A. Just did -- just --

21 Q. -- of sometime towards the end  
22 of 2011?

23 A. -- it's -- it was an old  
24 computer. It crashed --

25 Q. And where is it right --

1 RINAT R. AKHMETSHIN

2 e-mails?

3 A. I might.

4 Q. When you replaced the  
5 computer -- the older computer with a new  
6 computer at the end of 2011, did you  
7 transfer any of the data from the old  
8 computer to the new computer?

9 A. I did not. I did not.

10 Q. Other than e-mails, did you  
11 destroy any other documents --

12 MR. SPERDUTO: Objection --  
13 BY MR. COHEN:

14 Q. -- relating to --

15 MR. SPERDUTO: -- objection,  
16 objection --

17 BY MR. COHEN:

18 Q. -- Ashot Egiazaryan?

19 MR. SPERDUTO: -- objection to  
20 the form; that assumes facts not in  
21 what you're -- in evidence; and it's  
22 arg- --

23 THE WITNESS: I did not destroy  
24 anything in this --

25 MR. SPERDUTO: -- and it's

1 RINAT R. AKHMETSHIN

2 Mr. Vavilov is a private citizen,  
3 and he lives in the United States, resident  
4 of the United States and resident of Russia.  
5 So there's absolutely no FARA affiliation.

6 Q. Do you know where Mr. Vavilov  
7 got the cash from?

8 A. I don't know. You should ask  
9 him.

10 Q. Did Mr. Vavilov say whether  
11 there were other individuals or entities who  
12 were participating with him in initiating  
13 this project against Ashot Egiazaryan?

14 MR. SPERDUTO: Objection to the  
15 form.

16 THE WITNESS: Mr. Vavilov hates  
17 your client's guts. You know, he  
18 doesn't need any organizations. He  
19 hates him for --

20 BY MR. COHEN:

21 Q. Did he say --

22 A. -- a dozen years.

23 Q. -- did he say whether he was  
24 cooperating with anybody else?

25 A. I don't think so.

1 RINAT R. AKHMETSHIN

2 a very short break.

3 MR. COHEN: Sure, absolutely.

4 MR. SPERDUTO: Be right back.

5 THE VIDEOGRAPHER: The time is  
6 2:56. We're going off the record.  
7 This is the end of Disc Number 2,  
8 going on to Disc Number 3.

9 (Whereupon, a brief recess was  
10 taken from 2:56 p.m. to 3:06 p.m.)

11 THE VIDEOGRAPHER: The time is  
12 3:06 p.m. This is the beginning of  
13 Disc Number 3 in the deposition of  
14 Rinat Akhmetshin.

15 BY MR. COHEN:

16 Q. Just going back to Exhibit 170  
17 for a second.

18 A. Yes, sir.

19 Q. And that's the one that has the  
20 Dear colleagues?

21 A. Yes.

22 Q. And -- and you said that you  
23 don't consider yourself colleagues with the  
24 Public Strategies people; is that correct?

25 A. I did not -- I do not --

1 RINAT R. AKHMETSHIN

2 Q. And that's not --

3 A. -- consider myself a colleague.

4 Q. -- a phrase that you would  
5 use --

6 A. Definitely not.

7 Q. -- strike that.

8 That's not a phrase that you  
9 would use to describe your relationship with  
10 them?

11 A. Oh, definitely not.

12 Q. And -- and you wouldn't refer to  
13 Mr. Hitt or Mr. Eller or Mr. Laurence as a  
14 colleague; is that correct?

15 A. I definitely would not.

16 Q. By the way, who's -- who's --  
17 there's an A. Laurence.

18 A. I have no idea --

19 Q. Do you know who --

20 A. -- I never met him --

21 Q. -- do you know who Hilland --  
22 Hilland Knowlton is?

23 A. -- I know the firm, actually. I  
24 employed them years ago.

25 Q. Do you know them as relating to

1 RINAT R. AKHMETSHIN

2 any Ashot Egiazaryan issue?

3 A. I'm not aware of it, but I know  
4 the firm -- I heard the name -- I know the  
5 firm, actually. I used to know people there  
6 before.

7 Q. Do you know who Andrew Laurence  
8 is?

9 A. Never, never met him.

10 MR. COHEN: Ask the court  
11 reporter to mark as Exhibit 173 an  
12 e-mail from Rinat Akhmetshin to  
13 Levan Zgenti, who is not a person.  
14 Yeah, we have lots of copies.

15 - - -

16 (Whereupon, an e-mail was  
17 marked, for identification purposes, as  
18 Deposition Exhibit Number 173.)

19 - - -

20 MR. SPERDUTO: Oh, thank you.

21 MR. COHEN: And we'll get  
22 another one.

23 BY MR. COHEN:

24 Q. Okay. Do you know who  
25 Paul Butler is?

1 RINAT R. AKHMETSHIN

2 A. He's a lawyer there.

3 Q. He's a lawyer for who?

4 A. For -- I don't know. He's a  
5 lawyer at Akin Gump. He works for one of  
6 those interests which were hit by  
7 Mr. Egiazaryan.

8 Q. He's a lawyer for  
9 Suleiman Kerimov-related interests; is that  
10 correct?

11 A. I -- I think so, yes.

12 Q. Is that something --

13 A. He's a lawyer for the firm, I  
14 think, for the company which is -- some way  
15 there.

16 Q. And this is an e-mail from you  
17 to Levan Zgenti --

18 A. Um-hum.

19 Q. -- is that correct?

20 A. Yes.

21 Q. And -- and that's Russian -- is  
22 that -- is that a company or --

23 A. It's -- it's just a name, I  
24 think. It's not the name of the person;  
25 it's, like -- the name of the person is

1 RINAT R. AKHMETSHIN

2 Viktor.

3 Q. It's just an e-mail address?

4 A. It's an e-mail address, yes --

5 Q. Okay.

6 A. -- the name of the person is  
7 Viktor.

8 Q. And -- and what is the subject  
9 of this e-mail?

10 A. Let me just read it.

11 MR. SPERDUTO: You should use  
12 this.

13 THE WITNESS: Um-hum.

14 (Whereupon, the witness reviews  
15 the document.)

16 BY MR. COHEN:

17 Q. You copied Jeff Eller on this as  
18 well, right?

19 A. Correct, yes.

20 Q. And Greg Hitt?

21 A. Correct.

22 Q. And Paul Butler, who we just  
23 discussed; is that correct?

24 A. They were -- correct, yes.

25 Q. And you refer to all of those

1 RINAT R. AKHMETSHIN

2 individuals as colleagues; is that correct?

3 A. Yes, an unfortunate turn of  
4 phrase.

5 Q. At that point, you felt that  
6 they were colleagues?

7 A. I did not feel that way, but I  
8 think that since this was -- was it before or  
9 after this other colleague matter? Maybe  
10 it's something in this spirit.

11 But they were never my  
12 colleagues, sir, for the record.

13 Q. This e-mail is before the e-mail  
14 from Viktor referring to you as a colleague;  
15 is that correct? If I can ask you to  
16 compare --

17 A. Is this 15 --

18 Q. -- Exhibit 170 with 173.

19 A. One second.

20 March 23rd. February 25th.

21 Yes, it appears that way, sir.

22 Q. Why were you passing along this  
23 information to the -- these individuals and  
24 entities who work for Suleiman Kerimov?

25 A. Just to make them aware, because